## **ORDER SHEET**

# WEST BENGAL ADMINISTRATIVE TRIBUNAL

### Present-

Hon'ble Justice Soumitra Pal, Hon'ble Chairman. & Hon'ble Mr. P. Ramesh Kumar, Administrative Member.

#### Case No. OA 41 of 2019.

SMT. SUNITA NAYEK - VS- THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.

|                | SMT. SUNITA NAYEK – VS- THE STATE OF WEST BENGAL & ORS.           | Office and the date                         |
|----------------|---|---|
| Serial No. and | Order of the Tribunal with signature                              | Office action with date and dated signature |
| Date of order. | 2   | of parties when necessary                   |
| 1              |   | 3   |
| 3              | For the Applicant : Mrs. S. Mitra,                                |   |
|                | Advocate.   |   |
| 6.2.2019.      | For the State Respondent : Mr. G.P. Banerjee,                     |   |
|                | Advocate.   |   |
|                |   |   |
|                | Affidavit of service filed today be kept on                       |   |
|                | record.   |   |
|                | In this application the applicant, who was                        |   |
|                | appointed as a contingent sweeper on compassionate                |   |
|                | ground pursuant to the memo dated 24 <sup>th</sup> August, 1995,  |   |
|                | has prayed for a direction upon the respondents to                |   |
|                | consider the representation dated 26 <sup>th</sup> November, 2018 |   |
|                | praying for recording her service as a permanent Group D          |   |
|                | employee (sweeper) and to give promotional benefit of             |   |
|                | Career Advancement Scheme on completion of ten years              |   |
|                | and sixteen years of service in her salary as expeditiously       |   |
|                | as possible.  |   |
|                | Mrs. Sonali Mitra, learned advocate appearing                     |   |
|                | on behalf of the applicant, submits that in view of the           |   |
|                | judgement delivered on 13 <sup>th</sup> August, 2008 by the       |   |
|                | Supreme Court in Civil Appeal No. 5151-5152 of 2008               |   |
|                | (arising out of SLP(C) Nos. 3820-3821 of 2008): Union of          |   |
|                | India –v- Tarsem Singh (2008) 8 SCC 648, particularly the         |   |
|                | law laid down in paragraph 5 thereof, the applicant is            |   |
| L              |   | 1   |

## **ORDER SHEET**

Form No. .....

Vs.

**SMT. SUNITA NAYEK.** 

STATE OF W.B. & ORS.

Case No. **OA 41 of 2019**.

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order.<br>1 | Order of the Tribunal with signatu<br>2                       | ire                       | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessar |
|---------------------------------------|---|---------------------------|--|
|                                       | entitled to the reliefs as prayed for and                     | d accordingly             |  |
|                                       | direction may be issued on the respondent                     | s to consider             |  |
|                                       | her representation dated 26 <sup>th</sup> November,           | 2018, being               |  |
|                                       | annexure "C" to the application.                              |                           |  |
|                                       | Mr. G.P. Banerjee, learne                                     | d advocate                |  |
|                                       | appearing on behalf of the respondent subm                    | nits that since           |  |
|                                       | promotion if granted to the applicant is bo                   | und to affect             |  |
| the seniority of other employees, i   |   | f the law laid            |  |
|                                       | down in Union of India -versus- Tarsem Singh (supra),         |                           |  |
|                                       | particularly in paragraph 5, the applicant is not entitled to |                           |  |
|                                       | the reliefs as prayed for.                                    |                           |  |
|                                       | Having heard Mrs. Mitra and N                                 | Иr. Banerjee,             |  |
|                                       | learned advocates for the parties, in view o                  | f the law laid            |  |
|                                       | down in Union of India –versus- Tarsem S                      | Singh (supra),            |  |
|                                       | the promotional benefits given to the a                       | pplicant may              |  |
|                                       | affect the settled rights of third parti                      | es or other               |  |
|                                       | employees, no order can be passed on this                     | s application.            |  |
|                                       | Therefore, no order is passed on the app                      | olication. The            |  |
|                                       | application is disposed of. No order as to cos                | ts.                       |  |
|                                       | 1 '   | oumitra Pal)<br>Chairman. |  |
| Skg.                                  |   |                           |  |

## **ORDER SHEET**

|          | SMT. SUNITA NAYEK .  |
|----------|----------------------|
| Form No. | ••••                 |
|          | Vs.                  |
|          | STATE OF W.B. & ORS. |

Case No. **OA 41 of 2019.** 

| Serial No. and<br>Date of order.<br>1 | Order of the Tribunal with signature<br>2 | Office action with date and dated signature of parties when necessary |  |
|---------------------------------------|---|---|--|
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |
|                                       |   |   |  |